



Evaluation Score Card
Group Vision Benefits
RFP # 18076

		Superior Vision	Cigna	Dearborn National	EyeMed	Humana	Metlife	Standard Insurance	Unitedhealthcare
Evaluation Criteria	Maximum Score = 5	Score	Score	Score	Score	Score	Score	Score	Score
Plan Benefits & Service	35%	5.0	4.0	3.0	3.0	1.5	4.0	1.5	2.0
Network	15%	5.0	3.0	3.0	4.0	1.0	3.0	1.0	3.0
References	10%	5.0	5.0	3.0	3.0	3.0	4.0	3.0	3.0
Pricing/Fees/Renewals	40%	3.0	4.0	5.0	3.5	3.0	1.0	5.0	1.5
Total	100%	4.20	3.95	3.80	3.35	2.18	2.65	2.98	2.05

Proposed Vision Rates

		Superior Vision - BASIC PLAN - CURRENT	Superior Vision BASIC PLAN RECOMMENDED	Cigna	Dearborn National	EyeMed Vision Care, LLC	EyeMed Vision Care, LLC	Humana	Metropolitan Life Insurance Company	Standard Insurance Company	UnitedHealthcare
		Exam Only	Exam Only	Core Plan	Exam Only	Option Base	Option Base	Plan B	Option 1	Exam Plan	CORE
Employee Only	110	\$1.98	\$1.98	\$1.64	\$1.69	\$1.59	\$1.59	\$1.94	\$7.15	\$1.58	\$1.94
Employee + Spouse	35	\$3.94	\$3.94	\$3.27	\$3.36	\$3.15	\$3.15	\$3.87	\$14.38	\$3.15	\$3.92
Employee + Child(ren)	18	\$3.58	\$3.58	\$3.30	\$3.05	\$2.86	\$2.86	\$3.52	\$12.56	\$2.86	\$3.76
Employee + Family	36	\$5.90	\$5.90	\$5.27	\$5.03	\$4.72	\$4.72	\$5.79	\$21.09	\$4.71	\$6.34
Estimated Monthly Premiums		\$633	\$633	\$544	\$539	\$507	\$507	\$621	\$2,275	\$505	\$647
Estimated Annual Premiums		\$7,590	\$7,590	\$6,524	\$6,474	\$6,079	\$6,079	\$7,455	\$27,301	\$6,061	\$7,758
\$ difference vs. current											
		Superior Vision - BUY-UP PLAN - CURRENT	Superior Vision - BUY-UP PLAN RECOMMENDED	Cigna	Dearborn National	EyeMed Vision Care, LLC	EyeMed Vision Care, LLC	Humana	Metropolitan Life Insurance Company	Standard Insurance Company	UnitedHealthcare
		Buy Up	Buy Up	Buy-Up	Buy-Up	Option Buyup 1	Option Buyup 2	Plan B	Option 2	Full Coverage Plan	Buy Up
Employee Only	426	\$7.24	\$7.24	\$6.23	\$6.14	\$5.81	\$6.51	\$7.11	\$7.56	\$5.78	\$5.41
Employee + Spouse	152	\$14.56	\$14.56	\$12.47	\$12.36	\$11.69	\$13.10	\$14.30	\$15.21	\$11.63	\$10.87
Employee + Child(ren)	123	\$12.72	\$12.72	\$12.59	\$10.79	\$10.21	\$11.44	\$12.49	\$13.29	\$10.16	\$9.50
Employee + Family	192	\$21.36	\$21.36	\$20.10	\$18.13	\$17.15	\$19.21	\$20.98	\$22.31	\$17.06	\$15.95
Estimated Monthly Premiums		\$10,963	\$10,963	\$9,959	\$9,302	\$8,801	\$9,860	\$10,768	\$11,451	\$8,755	\$8,188
Estimated Annual Premiums		\$131,556	\$131,556	\$119,505	\$111,630	\$105,607	\$118,319	\$129,213	\$137,408	\$105,063	\$98,254
\$ difference vs. current											
Totals		Superior Vision - CURRENT	Superior Vision RECOMMENDED	Cigna	Dearborn National	EyeMed Vision Care, LLC	EyeMed Vision Care, LLC	Humana	Metropolitan Life Insurance Company	Standard Insurance Company	UHC
Estimated Annual Premiums		\$139,147	\$139,147	\$126,029	\$118,104	\$111,685	\$124,397	\$136,668	\$164,709	\$111,124	\$106,012
\$ difference vs. current			\$0	-\$13,118	-\$21,043	-\$27,462	-\$14,750	-\$2,478	\$25,563	-\$28,023	-\$33,135
% difference vs. current			0%	-9.4%	-15.1%	-19.7%	-10.6%	-1.8%	18.4%	-20.1%	-23.8%
Year 1		\$139,147	\$139,147	\$126,029	\$118,104	\$111,685	\$124,397	\$136,668	\$164,709	\$111,124	\$106,012
Year 2		\$139,147	\$139,147	\$126,029	\$118,104	\$111,685	\$111,685	\$136,668	\$164,709	\$111,124	\$106,012
Year 3		\$139,147	\$139,147	\$126,029	\$118,104	\$111,685	\$111,685	\$136,668	Not Provided	\$111,124	\$106,012
Year 4		\$139,147	\$139,147	\$126,029	\$118,104	\$111,685	\$111,685	\$136,668	Not Provided	\$111,124	Not Provided
Year 5		\$139,147	\$139,147	\$132,331	\$118,104	Not Provided	Not Provided	\$136,668	Not Provided	\$116,680	Not Provided
TOTAL 5-YEAR VALUE			\$695,735	\$636,448	\$590,518	-	-	\$683,342	-	\$561,176	-

Vision Disruption

No

0

11

11

8

24

10

18

10

Yes

35

24

24

27

11

25

17

25

Superior

Cigna

Dearborn

EyeMed

Humana

MetLife

Standard

UHC

Current Utilized
Provider "Alt ID"

City, State

In Network?
(Y/N)

1	GRAND PRAIRIE, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
2	VARIOUS	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
3	VARIOUS	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
4	VARIOUS	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes
5	GRAND PRAIRIE, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No
6	LANCASTER, TX	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes
7	GRAND PRAIRIE, TX	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
8	MANSFIELD, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
9	ARLINGTON, TX	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes
10	GRAND PRAIRIE, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	No
11	MANSFIELD, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
12	DUNCANVILLE, TX	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
13	GRAND PRAIRIE, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
14	MIDLOTHIAN, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes
15	BURLESON, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
16	ARLINGTON, TX	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No
17	ARLINGTON, TX	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No
18	MIDLOTHIAN, TX	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
19	HURST, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes
20	MIDLOTHIAN, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes
21	GRAND PRAIRIE, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes
22	PANTEGO, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
23	ARLINGTON, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
24	GRAND PRAIRIE, TX	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	No	No
25	WAXAHACHIE, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
26	GRAND PRAIRIE, TX	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
27	GRAND PRAIRIE, TX	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
28	ARLINGTON, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
29	MANSFIELD, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
30	GRAND PRAIRIE, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes
31	ARLINGTON, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No
32	IRVING, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No
33	GRAND PRAIRIE, TX	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
34	ARLINGTON, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
35	TERRELL, TX	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes