Life Insurance RFP Analysis
2015
Rates and Scoring Sheet

Vendor Name	Total In-Force Lives	Total In-Force Volume (as of Aug 2014)	Reliance Standard - Current	Dearborn National	AIG	Lincoln Financial Group	MetLife	Minnesota Life	The Standard	UNUM
			(Failed to Quote during Bid Process)	RECOMMENDED						
Basic Life (City Paid)			Cost per $1,000	Cost per $1,000	Cost per $1,000	Cost per $1,000	Cost per $1,000	Cost per $1,000	Cost per $1,000	Cost per $1,000
Basic Life Monthly Rate (City Paid)	1144	128,790,000	$0.12	$0.07	$0.12	$0.16	$0.11	$0.11	$0.12	$0.12
Estimated Monthly Cost			$15,455	$8,887	$15,455	$20,606	$13,523	$13,523	$15,455	$14,811
Employee Optional Life Age Band			Per $1,000 of Benefit	Per $1,000 of Benefit	Per $1,000 of Benefit	Per $1,000 of Benefit	Per $1,000 of Benefit	Per $1,000 of Benefit	Per $1,000 of Benefit	Per $1,000 of Benefit
Less than age 25	unknown	unknown	0.06	0.03	0.06	0.06	0.084	0.05	0.06	0.04
25 - 29	76	7,189,000	0.07	0.03	0.06	0.06	0.084	0.05	0.06	0.04
30 - 34	76	10,302,000	0.07	0.04	0.08	0.07	0.104	0.06	0.07	0.05
35 - 39	77	12,400,000	0.09	0.06	0.09	0.09	0.114	0.07	0.09	0.07
40 - 44	120	18,969,000	0.15	0.12	0.15	0.15	0.124	0.12	0.15	0.13
45 - 49	112	15,989,000	0.25	0.22	0.25	0.25	0.174	0.2	0.25	0.23
50 - 54	59	7,447,000	0.41	0.38	0.41	0.41	0.254	0.33	0.41	0.39
55 - 59	33	4,200,000	0.66	0.63	0.66	0.66	0.454	0.53	0.66	0.64
60 - 64	21	2,366,000	1.03	1.00	1.03	1.03	0.754	0.82	1.03	1.01
65 - 69	4	584,000	1.78	1.75	1.78	1.78	1.341	1.42	1.78	1.76
70 - 74	2	49,000	3.39	3.36	3.39	3.39	2.554	2.71	3.39	3.37
75 and over	0	0	3.39	3.36	3.39	3.39	3.364	2.71	3.39	3.37
Estimated Monthly Cost			18,651	16,194	18,682	18,579	14,714	14,905	18,579	16,989
Spouse Life - Age Band			Spouse Rates Per $1,000 of Benefit	Spouse Rates Per $1,000 of Benefit	Spouse Rates Per $1,000 of Benefit	Spouse Rates Per $1,000 of Benefit	Spouse Blended Rates Per $1,000 of Benefit	Spouse Rates Per $1,000 of Benefit	Spouse Rates Per $1,000 of Benefit	Spouse Rates Per $1,000 of Benefit
Less than age 25	0	0	0.06	0.03	0.06	0.06	0.077	0.05	0.06	0.04
25 - 29	29	2,103,000	0.07	0.03	0.06	0.06	0.077	0.05	0.06	0.04
30 - 34	47	3,979,000	0.07	0.04	0.08	0.07	0.097	0.06	0.07	0.05
35 - 39	40	3,367,000	0.09	0.06	0.09	0.09	0.107	0.07	0.09	0.07
40 - 44	59	4,919,000	0.15	0.12	0.15	0.15	0.117	0.12	0.15	0.13
45 - 49	63	4,451,000	0.25	0.22	0.25	0.25	0.167	0.2	0.25	0.23
50 - 54	50	2,879,000	0.41	0.38	0.41	0.41	0.247	0.33	0.41	0.39
55 - 59	26	1,449,000	0.66	0.63	0.66	0.66	0.447	0.53	0.66	0.64
60 - 64	9	330,000	1.03	1.00	1.03	1.03	0.747	0.82	1.03	1.01
65 - 69	7	245,000	1.78	1.75	1.78	1.78	1.334	1.42	1.78	1.76
70 - 74	2	42,000	3.39	3.36	3.39	3.39	2.547	2.71	3.39	3.37
75 and over	0	0	3.39	3.36	3.39	3.39	3.357	2.71	3.39	3.37
Estimated Monthly Cost			$5,634	$4,901	$5,653	$5,613	$4,266	$4,510	$5,613	$5,138
Child Life			Per $1,000	Per $1,000	Per $1,000	Per $1,000	Per Child Unit	Per $1,000	Per $1,000	Per $1,000
Per Child	422	7,693,000	0.08	0.08	0.08	0.2	0.08	0.08	0.08	
Estimated Monthly Cost			$615	$615	$615	$1,539	$615	$615	$615	$0
Voluntary AD&D			Per $1,000	Per $1,000	Per $1,000	Per $1,000	Per $1,000	Per $1,000	Per $1,000	Per $1,000
Employee	624	123,393,000	0.025	0.03	0.029	0.03	0.028	0.025		0.02
Spouse	235	25,877,000	0.07	0.03	0.02	0.05	0.036	0.07		0.02
Estimated Monthly Cost			$4,896	$4,478	$4,096	$4,996	$4,387	$4,896	$0	$2,985
Rate Guarantees				4 Years	3 Years	2 Years	3 Years	3 Years	3 Years	2 Years
Estimated Annual Premiums - 2015			$45,252	$420,896	$534,017	$615,997	$450,058	$461,405	$483,152	$479,082
Estimated Annual Premiums - 2016			NA	$420,896	$534,017	$615,997	$450,058	$461,405	$483,152	$479,082
Estimated Annual Premiums - 2017			NA	$420,896	$534,017	$677,596	$450,058	$461,405	$483,152	$526,990
Estimated Annual Premiums - 2018			NA	$420,896	$587,418	$677,596	$495,064	$507,545	$531,467	$526,990
Total Contract over 4 Years			FAILED TO QUOTE	$1,683,585	$2,189,469	$2,587,186	$1,845,237	$1,891,758	$1,980,922	$2,012,143
SCORING										
Services Offered (Scale of 1 - 5) - 40 pts				4	4	4	4	4	4	3
References (Scale of 1-5) - 20 pts				3	3	2	3	3	3	3
Fees (Scale of 1 - 5) - 40 pts				5	2	1	4	4	2	3
OVERALL SCORE				4.20	3.00	2.40	3.80	3.80	3.00	3.00

Life/Accidental Death and Dismemberment Insurance
RFP Analysis 2015
Plan / Benefit Comparison

Vendor Name	Reliance Standard - Current	AIG	Dearborn National	Lincoln Financial Group	MetLife	Minnesota Life	The Standard	UNUM
	Failed to Quote Renewal		RECOMMENDED					
Basic Life		2x Annual Salary to $500,000						
Maximum Benefit Minimum Benefit	2x salary to $500,000 $10,000	$500,000 $10,000	$500,000 $10,000	$500,000 $10,000	$500,000 $10,000	$500,000 $10,000	$5,000,000 2x annual earnings	
Guarantee Issue	$500,000 upon initial eligibility	$500,000	Insurance amounts in excess of $500,000, including any increases more than $25,000 over the GI, over a 12-month period based on the month of the policy anniversary date will require the submission and the approval of satisfactory evidence of insurability.	$500,000	$500,000	$500,000	3x annual earning or $850,000 combined base & Buyup	
Employee Optional Life								
Class Description	All active full time Employees	Match current	Match current	Match current	Match current	Match current	Match current	Match current
Definition of Earnings	Basic Monthly Earnings	Match current	Match current	Match current	Match current	Match current	Match current	Match current
Maximum Benefit **Minimum Benefit**	1, 2 or 3x Base Salary $350,000 $10,000	$350,000 N/A	$350,000 $10,000	$350,000 $10,000	3x or $350,000 $5,000	3x or $350,000 No minimum	$350,000 $1,000	$350,000 3 x annual earnings
Guarantee Issue	$350,000	$350,000	$350,000	$250,000	3x or $350,000	All coverage guaranteed at initial eligibility	$350,000	3x annual earning or $850,000 combined base & Buyup
Spouse Life								
Voluntary Life Amount for Spouse	$1,000 increments to $350,000				$250,000, not to exceed 50% of EE Opt Life Benefit	Lesser of $350,000 or employee's coverage amt	$350,000, not to exceed 100% of employees life benefit	
Maximum Benefit	350,000	$350,000	350,000	350,000				$350,000
Minimum Benefit	10,000	$1,000	10,000	5,000	$5,000	No minimum	$1,000	$10,000
Guarantee Issue	50,000	$50,000	50,000	$50,000	$25,000	$50,000 guaranteed at initial eligibility	50000	$25,000
Child Life								
Dependents up to age 25	$1,000 increments to $20,000							
Maximum Benefit **Minimum Benefit**	$20,000 $1,000	$20,000 $1,000	$20,000 $1,000	$10,000 $250	$20,000 $1,000	$20,000 No minimum	$20,000 not to exceed 100% of employees life benefit $1,000	$20,000 $10,000
Guarantee Issue	$10,000	$20,000	$10,000	All Gurantee Issue	$20,000	All coverage guaranteed at initial eligibility		$20,000
AD&D Benefits								
Voluntary AD&D Amount for Employees	1, 2, 3, 4 or 5x Base Salary							
Maximum Benefit	350,000	$850,000	350,000	350,000	The lesser of 5 times pay or $850,000	Lesser of five times earnings or $850,000	Matches Voluntary Life amount	$350,000
Minimum Benefit	10,000	N/A	10,000	10,000	$10,000.00	No minimum	Matches Voluntary Life amount	3 x annual earnings
Travel Assistance	Included	Included	Included	Included	Included with the Volunaty AD&D plan.	Included	FrontierMEDEX is a program of information, referral, coordination and assistance services for medical care situations and many other emergencies an insured individual and his or her family may experience when traveling 100 miles or more from home or for 180 days in a foreign country. Services include pre-trip assistance, medical assistance, emergency transportation, travel and technical assistance, legal services and medical supplies. Assistance is available 24/7/365.	NA
Voluntary AD&D Amount for Spouse		$1,000 increments up to $350,000						
Maximum Benefit	350,000	$350,000	350,000	350,000	$250,000, not to exceed 50% of employee's Optional Life Benefit	Lesser of $350,000 or employee's coverage amt	Matches Voluntary Life amount	$350,000
Minimum Benefit	10,000	$1,000	10,000	5,000	$5,000.00	No minimum	Matches Voluntary Life amount	$10,000
Seat Belt Benefit	Included	$10,000	Included	Included	10% up to $25,000	10% to $25,000	The Seat Belt Benefit is the lesser of $10,000 or the amount of AD&D insurance payable for loss of life for claims that meet seat belt requirements.	10%/$25000
Air Bag Benefit	Included	$10,000	Included	Included	5% up to $10,000	5% to $25,000 combined with Seat Belt Benefit	The Air Bag Benefit is the lesser of $5,000 or the amount of AD&D insurance benefit payable for loss of life for eligible claims.	5%/$5000
Tuition Reimbursement		Lesser of 5% or $5,000		Not Included	Child - $10,000 per year for 4 Yrs up to 20% of Full Amount Spouse - $5,000 per year for 1 Yr up to 5% of Full Amount	Child: 5% to $5,000 for up to 4 years Spouse: Up to $3,000	25% of the AD&D benefit, or $10,000, whichever is less for 3 years for spouse. Max/year = $5000. No child benefits payable.	NA
Day Care Expense Benefit		Lesser of 5% or $5,000		Not Included	Included with the Volunaty AD&D plan. - $5,000 per year for 4 Yrs up to 12% of Full Amount	N/A	For children under age 13. 25% of the AD&D benefit amount or $10,000, whichever is less for 36 months for eligible claims. Max/year = $5,000	NA

Long Term Disability (LTD)
2015 RFP Analysis
Benefits, Rates and Scoring Summary

Benefits	Reliance Standard - Current	Dearborn National RECOMMENDED	AIG	Lincoln Financial Group	MetLife	The Standard	UNUM
Monthly Benefit Percentage	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%	50%
Maximum Monthly Benefit	$5,500	$5,500	$5,500	$5,500	$5,500	$5,500	$5,500
Minimum Monthly Benefit	Greater of $100 or 10% of Benefit	Greater of $100 or 10% of Benefit	Greater of $100 or 10% of Benefit	Greater of $100 or 10% of Benefit	Greater of $100 or 10% of Benefit	Greater of $100 or 10% of Benefit	Greater of $100 or 10% of Benefit
Elimination Period	180 Days	180 Days	180 Days	180 Days	180 Days	180 Days	180 Days
Benefit Duration	SSNRA	SSNRA	SSNRA	Later of Age 65 or SSNRA	The Greater of RBD or SSNRA	SSNRA	SSNRA
Definition of Eligibility	All Active Full-time Employees	All Active Full-time Employees	All Active Full-time Employees	All Active Full-time Employees	All Active Full-time Employees	All Active Full-time Employees	All Active Full-time Employees
Definition of Earnings	Included	Included	Included	Included	Included	Included	Included
Actively at Work Provision	Included	Included	Included	Included	Not Included	Included	Included
Social Security offset integration (i.e. Family, Primary)	Family	Family	Family	Primary & Family	Family	Family	Primary & Family
Regular (Own) Occupation Period	24 Months	24 Months	24 Months	24 Months	24 Months	24 months	24 Months
Residual Disability	Included	Included	Included	Included	Included	Included	Included
Return to Work Incentive	Included	Included	Included	Included	Included	Included	Included
Rehabilitation Requirement (mandatory or voluntary)	Mandatory	Voluntary	Mandatory	Mandatory	Voluntary	Mandatory	voluntary
Conversion	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Included	Included	Included	Not Included
Benefit Taxation	Taxable	Taxable	Taxable	Taxable	Taxable	Taxable	Taxable
	Benefit Amount/Limits	Benefit Amount/Limits	Benefit Amount/Limits	Benefit Amount/Limits	Benefit Amount/Limits	Benefit Amount/Limits	Benefit Amount/Limits
Pre-Existing Condition Limitation	3/12 Pre Ex	3/12 Pre Ex	3/12 Pre Ex	3/12 Pre Ex	3/12 Pre Ex	24 Months Lifetime	3/12 Pre Ex
Mental & Nervous	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime
Drug & Alcohol	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime
Self Reported Symptoms	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime	24 Months Lifetime
Survivor Benefit	3 Months Lump Sum	3 Months Lump Sum	3 Months Lump Sum	3 Months Lump Sum	3 Months Lump Sum	3 Month Lump Sum	3 Months Lump Sum
Spousal Rehabilitation Benefit	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included
Child Care Benefit	Included	Included	Included	Not Included	Included	Included	Included
Elder Care Benefit	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included
Family Care Benefit	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Included	Included	Not Included	Included
Activities of Daily Living (ADL) Benefit	Not Included	Included	Not Included	Included	Not Included	Included	Not Included
Cola	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included
Please list and describe additional benefits included at no additional charge.	Benefit	Benefit	Benefit	Benefit	Benefit	Benefit	Benefit
1 Catastrophic Disability Benefit	Not Included	Included	Included	Not Included	Included	Not Included	Not Included
2 EAP		Included	Included			Included	Included
3 FICA services with W2 Prep			Included				
4 Travel							Included
Please list and describe additional benefits that may be included for an additional charge.	Benefit/Cost	Benefit/Cost	Benefit/Cost	Benefit/Cost	Benefit/Cost	Benefit/Cost	Benefit/Cost
1 EAP with Face-to-Face Visits			PEPM			Family Care Benefit can be added for an increase of 0.01 to rate.	
	Per $100 of Covered Payroll	Per $100 of Covered Payroll	Per $100 of Covered Payroll	Per $100 of Covered Payroll	Per $100 of Covered Payroll	Per $100 of Covered Payroll	Per $100 of Covered Payroll
Rate Guarantee		4 Years	3 Years	3 Years	3 Years	3 years	2 years
Volume	5,389,488	5,389,488	5,389,488	5,389,488	5,389,488	5,389,488	5,389,488
Monthly Rate	$0.125	$0.123	$0.125	$0.120	$0.125	$0.125	$0.125
Monthly Premiums	$6,737	$6,629	$6,737	$6,467	$6,737	$6,737	$6,737
Estimated Annual Premiums - 2015	$80,842	$79,549	$80,842	$77,609	$80,842	$80,842	$80,842
Estimated Annual Premiums - 2016	DID NOT QUOTE	$79,549	$80,842	$77,609	$80,842	$80,842	$80,842
Estimated Annual Premiums - 2017	DID NOT QUOTE	$79,549	$80,842	$77,609	$80,842	$80,842	$88,927
Estimated Annual Premiums - 2018	DID NOT QUOTE	$79,549	$88,927	$85,369	$88,927	$88,927	$97,819
Total Contract over 4 Years		$318,195	$331,454	$318,195	$331,454	$331,454	$348,430

Orange Font represents a defaulted 10% increase since they did not quote that year's cost

SCORING

	Dearborn National	AIG	Lincoln Financial Group	MetLife	The Standard	UNUM
Services Offered (Scale of 1 - 5) - 40 pts	4	3	3	4	3	3
References (Scale of 1-5) - 20 pts	3	3	2	3	3	3
Fees (Scale of 1 - 5) - 40 pts	4	3	4	3	3	2
OVERALL SCORE	3.80	3.00	3.20	3.40	3.00	2.60