

Firefighter Occupational Health Vendor Comparison

RFP Bid #15149

PHYSICAL TESTING SERVICES (FIREFIGHTERS)	# Tests (Newhire)	# Tests (Annual)	CARENOW				CONCENTRA				MEDHEALTH				OCCU-MED RECOMMENDED				
			Unit Cost Year 1 - 3	Unit Cost Year 4	Unit Cost Year 5	Annual Year 1-3	Unit Cost Year 1 - 3	Unit Cost Year 4	Unit Cost Year 5	Annual Year 1-3	Unit Cost Year 1 - 3	Unit Cost Year 4	Unit Cost Year 5	Annual Year 1-3	Unit Cost Year 1 - 3	Unit Cost Year 4	Unit Cost Year 5	Annual Year 1-3	
Firefighter Pre Hire Physical (health history)	10	78	\$75	\$83	\$91	\$6,600	\$111	\$111	\$111	\$9,724	\$365	\$420	\$431	\$32,120	\$173	\$178	\$183	\$15,180	
Vision Testing (acuity, depth perception, color blindness)	10	78	\$20	\$22	\$24	\$1,760	\$20	\$20	\$21	\$1,760	\$35	\$40	\$41	\$3,080	INC			\$0	
Audiogram	10	78	\$30	\$33	\$36	\$2,640	\$20	\$20	\$21	\$1,760	\$17	\$20	\$20	\$1,496	\$58	\$59	\$61	\$5,060	
EKG	10	78	\$65	\$72	\$79	\$5,720	\$25	\$26	\$26	\$2,200	\$45	\$52	\$53	\$3,960	\$58	\$59	\$61	\$5,060	
Spirometries (Pulmonary Function Test)	10	78	\$45	\$50	\$54	\$3,960	\$34	\$35	\$35	\$2,992	\$180	\$207	\$212	\$15,840	\$58	\$59	\$61	\$5,060	
CHEM 19, CBC, CHD, UA (P949), SMAC	10	78	\$109	\$120	\$132	\$9,592	\$95	\$97	\$99	\$8,360	\$95	\$109	\$112	\$8,360	\$41	\$43	\$44	\$3,643	
Cholesterol Evaluation	10	78	\$80	\$88	\$97	\$7,040	INC			\$0	\$50	\$58	\$59	\$4,400	\$7	\$7	\$7	\$607	
PSA (T099)	10	25	\$80	\$88	\$97	\$2,800	\$44	\$45	\$46	\$1,540	\$15	\$17	\$18	\$525	\$17	\$18	\$18	\$604	
Haz Mat - Heavy Metal Screens	0	18	\$110	\$121	\$133	\$1,980	\$153	\$156	\$159	\$2,754	\$325	\$374	\$384	\$5,850	\$76	\$78	\$81	\$1,366	
Drug Screens - 5 panel, non- DOT	10	0	\$38	\$42	\$46	\$380	\$45	\$46	\$47	\$450	\$20	\$23	\$24	\$200	\$30	\$31	\$32	\$299	
MRO Services	10	0	INC				INC				\$0	NQ				\$0	INC		
On-Site Collection	10	0	\$15	\$17	\$18	\$150	\$60	\$61	\$62	\$600	NQ			\$0	\$51	\$53	\$54	\$510	
GC/MS confirmation	10	0	\$190	\$209	\$230	\$1,900	INC				\$0	\$170	\$196	\$201	\$1,700	INC			\$0
Occult Blood	10	0	\$22	\$24	\$27	\$220	\$20	\$20	\$21	\$200	\$15	\$17	\$18	\$150	\$21	\$21	\$22	\$207	
TB Test (PPD)	10	0	\$20	\$22	\$24	\$200	\$22	\$22	\$23	\$220	\$25	\$29	\$30	\$250	\$17	\$18	\$18	\$173	
I-View Chest x-rays	1	0	\$50	\$55	\$61	\$50	\$55	\$56	\$57	\$55	\$65	\$75	\$77	\$65	\$81	\$83	\$85	\$81	
Hepatitis B Titer Test	10	0	\$70	\$77	\$85	\$700	INC			\$0	\$75	\$86	\$89	\$750	\$16	\$17	\$17	\$161	
Hepatitis B Booster	10	0	\$80	\$88	\$97	\$800	\$75	\$77	\$78	\$750	\$75	\$86	\$89	\$750	\$98	\$101	\$104	\$978	
Admin Fee (only charged for onsite testing)	0	78	N/A				N/A				N/A				\$0	\$85	\$88	\$90	\$6,630
Scheduling Fee (only charged when offsite)	10	0													\$0	\$25	\$26	\$27	\$250
Venipuncture Fee (only charged when offsite)	10	0													\$0	\$17	\$18	\$18	\$173
Projected Cost by Year and Totaled																			
Per Year - Years 1-3			\$47,000				\$34,000				\$80,000				\$47,000				
Year 4			\$52,000				\$34,000				\$92,000				\$48,000				
Year 5			\$57,000				\$35,000				\$94,000				\$49,000				
Value of Contract Over 5 Years			\$250,000				\$171,000				\$426,000				\$238,000				

OTHER TESTING SERVICES (FIREFIGHTERS)	# Tests (Newhire)	Estimated # Tests (Annual)	CARENOW				CONCENTRA				MEDHEALTH				OCCU-MED RECOMMENDED			
			Unit Cost Year 1 - 3	Unit Cost Year 4	Unit Cost Year 5	Annual Year 1-3	Unit Cost Year 1 - 3	Unit Cost Year 4	Unit Cost Year 5	Annual Year 1-3	Unit Cost Year 1 - 3	Unit Cost Year 4	Unit Cost Year 5	Annual Year 1-3	Unit Cost Year 1 - 3	Unit Cost Year 4	Unit Cost Year 5	Annual Year 1-3
Breath Alcohol Tests - DOT regulated	0	0	\$25	\$28	\$30	\$0	\$21	\$21	\$22	\$0	NQ				\$35	\$36	\$37	\$0
FCE (Functional Capacity Evaluation)	0	0					NQ				\$495	\$569	\$584	\$0	\$86	\$89	\$92	\$0
Functional Stress Test/TST	0	0	\$190	\$190	\$209	\$0	\$350	\$350	\$350	\$0	\$170	\$196	\$201	\$0	\$230	\$237	\$244	\$0
HIV Test	0	0	\$120	\$132	\$145	\$0	\$98	\$100	\$102	\$0	\$25	\$29	\$30	\$0	\$17	\$18	\$18	\$0
Hepatitis B Surface Antibody (when req'd)	0	0	\$80	\$88	\$97	\$0	\$57	\$58	\$59	\$0	\$75	\$86	\$89	\$0	INC			
Measles Vaccine	0	0	\$35	\$39	\$42	\$0	\$65	\$66	\$68	\$0	\$75	\$86	\$89	\$0	\$104	\$107	\$110	\$0
Mumps Vaccine	0	0	\$40	\$44	\$48	\$0	INC				\$75	\$86	\$89	\$0	INC			
Body Fat Analysis	0	0	\$15	\$17	\$18	\$0	\$15	\$15	\$16	\$0	\$25	\$29	\$30	\$0	\$30	\$31	\$32	\$0
COMP Metabolic Panel	0	0	\$55	\$61	\$67	\$0	\$45	\$46	\$47	\$0	\$295	\$339	\$348	\$0	\$10	\$11	\$11	\$0

**City of Grand Prairie
Fire Fighter Occupational Health Srv
Evaluation Score - RFB # 15149**

NOT SHORTLISTED NON RESPONSIVE

Occu-Med Christopher St. George Fort Worth, TX 559-435-7200 cstgeorge@occu-med.com	CareNow Jillian Wood Grand Prairie, TX 972-745-7500 x8192 jillianwq@carenow.com	Concentra Mignon Labranch Arlington, TX 972-988-0441 mignon_labranch@concentra.com	MedHealth Paul Foarrow Dallas, TX 214-884-4735	Nova Healthcare, PA Tania Gonzales Houston, TX 832-320-3192 taniasgonzales@n-o-v-a.com
--	--	---	---	--

Criteria	Max Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score	Rating	Score
Service Procedures	20	4.14	16.56	4.14	16.56	3.51	14.04	4.14	16.56	NA	
Knowledge & Experience	15	4.00	12.00	2.75	8.25	5.00	15.00	0.50	1.50	NA	
Availability & Quality of Staff	30	4.50	27.00	2.50	15.00	3.25	19.50	0.50	3.00	NA	
Adequacy & Location of Facilities	10	5.00	10.00	3.25	6.50	2.75	5.50	0.75	1.50	NA	
References	5	3.54	3.54	4.04	4.04	3.00	3.00	3.40	3.40	NA	
Fees Renewals & Guarantees	20	4.71	18.84	3.51	14.04	3.00	12.00	1.70	6.80	NA	
Total Score	100		87.94		64.39		69.04		32.76		NA