

Life Insurance RFP Cost Analysis

	Dearborn - Current	Dearborn - PROPOSED	Hartford (RECOMMENDED)	Lincoln	MetLife	Mutual of Omaha	Prudential	Securian/Ochs	Standard	UHC	Unum
Basic Life	\$0.069	\$0.040	\$0.050	\$0.071	\$0.062	\$0.055	\$0.093	\$0.069	\$0.090	\$0.129	\$0.069
Volume	\$159,882,950	174,861,101	174,861,101	174,861,101	174,861,101	174,861,101	174,861,101	174,861,101	174,861,101	174,861,101	174,861,101
Annual Premiums	\$132,383	\$83,933	\$104,917	\$148,982	\$130,097	\$115,408	\$181,051	\$144,785	\$188,850	\$270,685	\$144,785
Current vs Proposed %		-36.6%	-20.7%	12.5%	-1.7%	-12.8%	36.8%	9.4%	42.7%	104.5%	9.4%
2019		\$83,933	\$104,917	\$148,982	\$130,097	\$115,408	\$181,051	\$144,785	\$188,850	\$270,685	\$144,785
2020		\$83,933	\$104,917	\$148,982	\$130,097	\$115,408	\$181,051	\$144,785	\$188,850	\$270,685	\$144,785
2021		\$83,933	\$104,917	\$148,982	\$130,097	\$132,720	\$181,051	\$144,785	\$188,850	Not Offering	\$154,920
2022		\$96,523	\$104,917	Not Offering	Not Offering	\$152,628	Not Included*	\$144,785	\$207,735	Not Offering	Not Offering
2023		\$111,002	\$115,408	Not Offering	Not Offering	\$175,522	Not Included*	\$144,785	\$228,508	Not Offering	Not Offering
TOTAL for 5 Years		\$459,325	\$535,075			\$691,685		\$723,925	\$1,002,793		
Rate Guarantee		3 Yr Rate Guar. + 2 Yr Rate Cap(s)	4 Yr Rate Guar. + Yr 5-10%; annual renewal after if agreeable	3 Years only	3 Years only	2 Yr Guar, then 15% cap/yr after 2	3 Yr Rate Guar.; 4th/5th yr ONLY IF loss ratio <77%	5 years	3 Yr Rate Guar.; 10% Yr 4; 10% Yr 5	2 Years Only	2 Yr Rate Guar; 7% Yr 3
Employee/Spouse Supp Life											
Volume	\$148,247,000	\$157,412,691	\$157,412,691	\$157,412,691	\$157,412,691	\$157,412,691	\$157,412,691	\$157,412,691	\$157,412,691	\$157,412,691	\$157,412,691
Rate/\$1,000	Varies -Age Rated	Age Rated-match current	Age Rated-match current	Age Rated-match current	Age Rated-match current	Age Rated-match current	Age Rated-match current	Age Rated-match current	Age Rated-match current	Age Rated-match current	Age Rated-match current
Annual Cost	\$335,176	\$355,900	\$355,900	\$355,900	\$355,900	\$355,900	\$355,900	\$355,900	\$355,900	\$355,900	\$355,900
Employee AD&D											
Volume	\$159,760,000	\$174,726,632	\$174,726,632	\$174,726,632	\$174,726,632	\$174,726,632	\$174,726,632	\$174,726,632	\$174,726,632	\$174,726,632	\$174,726,632
Rate/\$1,000	\$0.02	\$0.02	\$0.02	\$0.02	\$0.024	\$0.04	\$0.02	\$0.02	\$0.02	\$0.02	\$0.02
Annual Cost	\$38,342	\$41,934	\$41,934	\$41,934	\$50,321	\$83,869	\$41,934	\$41,934	\$41,934	\$41,934	\$41,934
Spouse AD&D											
Volume	\$40,577,000	\$43,000,000	\$43,000,000	\$43,000,000	\$43,000,000	\$43,000,000	\$43,000,000	\$43,000,000	\$43,000,000	\$43,000,000	\$43,000,000
Rate/\$1,000	\$0.02	\$0.02	\$0.02	\$0.02	\$0.017	\$0.04	\$0.02	\$0.02	\$0.02	\$0.02	\$0.02
Annual Cost	\$9,738	\$10,320	\$10,320	\$10,320	\$8,772	\$20,640	\$10,320	\$10,320	\$10,320	\$10,320	\$10,320
Child Life											
Volume	\$8,281,000	\$8,500,000	\$8,500,000	\$8,500,000	\$8,500,000	\$8,500,000	\$8,500,000	\$8,500,000	\$8,500,000	\$8,500,000	\$8,500,000
Rate/\$1,000	\$0.08	\$0.08	\$0.08	\$0.08	\$0.08	\$0.08	\$0.08	\$0.08	\$0.08	\$0.08	\$0.08
Annual Cost	\$7,950	\$8,160	\$8,160	\$8,160	\$8,160	\$8,160	\$8,160	\$8,160	\$8,160	\$8,160	\$8,160
2019 - Total Est. Cost	\$523,590	\$500,248	\$521,231	\$565,296	\$553,250	\$583,977	\$597,365	\$561,099	\$605,164	\$686,999	\$561,099
2020 - Total Est. Cost		\$500,248	\$521,231	\$565,296	\$553,250	\$583,977	\$597,365	\$561,099	\$605,164	\$686,999	\$561,099
2021 - Total Est. Cost		\$500,248	\$521,231	\$565,296	\$553,250	\$601,288	\$597,365	\$561,099	\$605,164	No Quote	\$571,234
2022 - Total Est. Cost		\$512,838	\$521,231	No Quote	No Quote	\$621,196	No Quote	\$561,099	\$624,049	No Quote	No Quote
2023 - Total Est. Cost		\$527,316	\$531,723	No Quote	No Quote	\$644,090	No Quote	\$561,099	\$644,823	No Quote	No Quote
5 Year Est Contract Value		\$2,540,897	\$2,616,647	-	-	\$3,034,529	-	\$2,805,497	\$3,084,365	-	-

LTD RFP Cost Analysis

	Dearborn - Current	Dearborn - Proposed	Hartford	Lincoln	Madison National	MetLife	Mutual of Omaha	Prudential	Standard	Unum
Volume		\$7,000,000	\$7,000,000	\$7,000,000	\$7,000,000	\$7,000,000	\$7,000,000	\$7,000,000	\$7,000,000	\$7,000,000
Rate/\$100 of Volume	\$0.123	\$0.114	\$0.133	\$0.123	\$0.110	\$0.155	\$0.110	\$0.136	\$0.182	\$0.110
Monthly Premiums	\$0	\$7,980	\$9,310	\$8,610	\$7,700	\$10,850	\$7,700	\$9,520	\$12,740	\$7,700
Annual Premiums	\$103,320	\$95,760	\$111,720	\$103,320	\$92,400	\$130,200	\$92,400	\$114,240	\$152,880	\$92,400
% Difference vs. Current		-7.3%	8.1%	0.0%	-10.6%	26.0%	-10.6%	10.6%	48.0%	-10.6%
Rate Guarantee		4 Years	4 Years (yr 5, 0-20% based upon loss ratio; addtl renewals allowed)	3 years (Yr 2 - 12%; Yr 3 - 12%)	5 Years	3 years	2 years; Yr 3 - 15% cap	3 Yrs (Yr 2 10%; Yr 3 10%)	3 years (Yr 2 18%, Yr 3 20%)	2 Years
2019		\$95,760	\$111,720	\$103,320	\$92,400	\$130,200	\$92,400	\$114,240	\$152,880	\$92,400
2020		\$95,760	\$111,720	\$115,718	\$92,400	\$130,200	\$92,400	\$125,664	\$180,398	\$92,400
2021		\$95,760	\$111,720	\$129,605	\$92,400	\$130,200	\$106,260	\$138,230	\$216,478	Not offered
2022		\$95,760	\$111,720	Not offered	\$92,400	Not offered	Not offered	Rates Guaranteed if Loss Ratio <=70%	\$259,774	Not offered
2023		\$100,548	\$117,306	Not offered	\$92,400	Not offered	Not offered	Rates Guaranteed if Loss Ratio <=70%	\$316,924	Not offered
5 Year Est Contract Value		\$483,588	\$564,186	-	\$462,000	-	-	-	\$1,126,454	-

City of Grand Prairie - RFP Scorecard

Life RFP Scoring

9/19/2018

SCORING (1=worst; 5=best)	Dearborn	Hartford (Recommended)	Lincoln	MetLife	Mutual of Omaha	Prudential	Securian/ Ochs	Standard	UHC	Unum
Plan Benefits and Services Offered (Scale 1-5) - 35pts	2	4	2	4	2	4	2	2	2	3
Network (contract terms) (Scale 1-5) - 15pts	3	3	3	3	2	3	5	2	2	2
References (Scale 1-5) - 10pts	1	4	3	3	3	2	2	3	2	4
Fees (Scale 1-5) - 40pts	5	5	2	2	3	1	4	2	1	2
TOTAL POINTS	3.25	4.25	2.25	2.95	2.5	2.45	3.25	2.1	1.6	2.55

LTD RFP Scoring

9/19/2018

SCORING (1=worst; 5=best)	Dearborn	Hartford (Recommended)	Lincoln	MetLife	Mutual of Omaha	Prudential	Madison National	Standard	Unum
Plan Benefits and Services Offered (Scale 1-5) - 35pts	3	4	4	2	3	3	3	2	3
Network (contract terms) (Scale 1-5) - 15pts	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
References (Scale 1-5) - 10pts	2	4	3	3	3	2	2	3	2
Fees (Scale 1-5) - 40pts	4	4	2	1	2	1	5	1	1
TOTAL POINTS	3.3	3.85	2.95	1.85	2.6	2.1	3.7	1.85	2.1