| Evaluation Score Card<br>Digital eBooks<br><br>RFP # 19062 | | EBSCO | BAKER & TAYLOR | BIBLIOTHECA | OVERDRIVE |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **Evaluation Criteria** | **Maximum Score** | **Score** | **Score** | **Score** | **Score** |
| Price & Fees | 50.00 | *VENDOR DOES NOT MEET CITY REQIREMENTS - UNRESPONSIVE* | 36.26 | 39.75 | 38.58 |
| Product & Services | 40.00 | | 26.00 | 28.00 | 39.00 |
| Reputation & Past Relationship with the City | 5.00 | | 3.00 | 3.00 | 5.00 |
| Local Business Presence | 5.00 | | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| **Total** | **100.00** | | **65.26** | **70.75** | **82.58** |

Bids were publically opened and read at the City of Grand Prairie Office of the Purchasing Division at the time indicated above.  The bid tabulation has been verified, by tabulator, as accurate based on the Unit Cost presented by each bidder.

## PRICE & FEES (50 POINTS)

| ANNUAL FEE | QTY | BAKER & TAYLOR | | BIBLIOTHECA | | OVERDRIVE | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | UNIT COST | EXTENDED COST | UNIT COST | EXTENDED COST | UNIT COST | EXTENDED COST |
| ANNUAL FEE (YR 1) | 1 | 0.00 | $ - | 0.00 | $ - | 6000.00 | $ 6,000.00 |
| ANNUAL FEE (YR 2) | 1 | 0.00 | $ - | 0.00 | $ - | 6000.00 | $ 6,000.00 |
| ANNUAL FEE (YR 3) | 1 | 100.00 | $ 100.00 | 1000.00 | $ 1,000.00 | 6000.00 | $ 6,000.00 |
| ANNUAL FEE (YR 4) | 1 | 100.00 | $ 100.00 | 1000.00 | $ 1,000.00 | 6000.00 | $ 6,000.00 |
| ANNUAL FEE (YR 5) | 1 | 100.00 | $ 100.00 | 2000.00 | $ 2,000.00 | 6000.00 | $ 6,000.00 |
| ANNUAL FEE (YR 6) | 1 | 100.00 | $ 100.00 | 2000.00 | $ 2,000.00 | 6000.00 | $ 6,000.00 |
| ANNUAL FEE (YR 7) | 1 | 100.00 | $ 100.00 | 2000.00 | $ 2,000.00 | 6000.00 | $ 6,000.00 |
| ANNUAL FEE (YR 8) | 1 | 100.00 | $ 100.00 | 3000.00 | $ 3,000.00 | 6000.00 | $ 6,000.00 |
| ANNUAL FEE (YR 9) | 1 | 100.00 | $ 100.00 | 3000.00 | $ 3,000.00 | 6000.00 | $ 6,000.00 |
| ANNUAL FEE (YR 10) | 1 | 100.00 | $ 100.00 | 3000.00 | $ 3,000.00 | 6000.00 | $ 6,000.00 |
| ANNUAL FEE (10 - YEAR) TOTAL | | | $ 800.00 | | $ 17,000.00 | | $ 60,000.00 |
| EMENTATION/INTERNAL START UP COST | 1 | $ 3,000.00 | $ 3,000.00 | $ 3,000.00 | $ 3,000.00 | | $ - |
| CATALOGING/MARC FEES (10-YEAR) | 7000.00 | $ 2.00 | $ 14,000.00 | $ - | $ - | $ - | $ - |
| TOTAL 10 - YEAR COST | | | $ 17,800.00 | | $ 20,000.00 | | $ 60,000.00 |

| MAX POINTS | CONTENT | BAKER & TAYLOR | | | BIBLIOTHECA | | | OVERDRIVE | | | MIN |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | CONTENT AVAILABLE | RATIO TO TOTAL COST | SCORE | CONTENT AVAILABLE | RATIO TO TOTAL COST | SCORE | CONTENT AVAILABLE | RATIO TO TOTAL COST | SCORE | |
| 10 | Ebooks | 1700000.00 | $ 0.0105 | 13.13 | 1454918.00 | $ 0.0137 | 10.00 | 1746775.00 | $ 0.0343 | 4.00 | $ 0.0137 |
| 5 | Audio Books | 145000.00 | $ 0.1228 | 5.59 | 145803.00 | $ 0.1372 | 5.00 | 150550.00 | $ 0.3985 | 1.72 | $ 0.1372 |
| 15 | Publishers | 500.00 | $ 35.60 | 4.21 | 1300 | $ 15.38 | 9.75 | 6000.00 | $ 10.00 | 15 | $ 10.00 |
| 30 | FEE TO CONTENT RATIO TOTAL SCORE | | | 22.93 | | | 24.75 | | | 20.72 | |

*2018 Best Seller Titles*

| MAX POINTS | Title | Author | QTY | BAKER & TAYLOR | | | | BIBLIOTHECA | | | | OVERDRIVE | | | | MIN |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | Unit Cost | Disc | Ext Cost | SCORE | Unit Cost | Disc | Ext Cost | SCORE | Unit Cost | Disc | Ext Cost | SCORE | |
| 5 | Little Fires Everywhere | Celeste Ng | 1 | $ 52.25 | | $ 52.25 | 5 | $ 55.00 | 5% | $ 52.25 | 5 | $ 55.00 | 1.50% | $ 54.18 | 4.82 | $ 52.25 |
| 5 | The President is Missing | James Patterson an | 1 | $ 85.50 | | $ 85.50 | 3.33 | $ 59.99 | 5% | $ 56.99 | 5 | $ 90.00 | 1.50% | $ 88.65 | 3.21 | $ 56.99 |
| 5 | Before We Were Yours | Wingate | 1 | $ 52.25 | | $ 52.25 | 5 | $ 55.00 | 5% | $ 52.25 | 5 | $ 55.00 | 1.50% | $ 54.18 | 4.82 | $ 52.25 |
| 5 | Beneath a Scarlet Sky | Mark Sullivan | 1 | NA | | | 0 | NA | | | 0 | $ 40.00 | 1.50% | $ 39.40 | 5 | |
| 20 | TITLE PRICE TOTAL SCORE | | | | | | 13.33 | | | | 15.00 | | | | 17.86 | |

| | BAKER & TAYLOR | BIBLIOTHECA | OVERDRIVE |
|---|---|---|---|
| FEE TO CONTENT RATIO | 22.93 | 24.75 | 20.72 |
| TITLE PRICE | 13.33 | 15.00 | 17.86 |
| TOTAL SCORE | 36.26 | 39.75 | 38.58 |

## PRODUCT & SERVICES (40 POINTS)

| POINTS | CRITERIA | EBSCO | BAKER & TAYLOR | BIBLIOTHECA | OVERDRIVE |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 25 | Compatibility | | 15 | 15 | 25 |
| 5 | Implementation Process & Timeline | | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| 5 | Product Features and Functionality | | 4 | 5 | 4 |
| 5 | Customer Service & Technical Support | | 4 | 4 | 5 |
| **40** | | | **26** | **28** | **39** |

## REPUTATION & PAST RELATIONSHIP WITH THE CITY (5 POINTS)

| POINTS | CRITERIA | EBSCO | BAKER & TAYLOR | BIBLIOTHECA | OVERDRIVE |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 2<br>Yes = 2, No = 0 | Has your company engaged in the business of providing an online eBook integrated database for a minimum of two years within the last three years. | | YES | YES | YES |
| 1<br>Yes = 1, No = 0 | Is your company in good financial standing, not in any form of bankruptcy, current in payment of all taxes and fees such as state franchise fees. | | YES | YES | YES |
| 2<br>Yes = 2, No = 0 | Has your company previously conducted business with the City of Grand Prairie within the past five (5) years? | | NO | NO | YES |
| **5** | | | **3** | **3** | **5** |

RFP 19062 - DIGITAL EBOOKS

## PRODUCT & SERVICES EVALUATION (40 POINTS)

| POINTS | CRITERIA | EBSCO | BAKER & TAYLOR | BIBLIOTHECA | OVERDRIVE |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 25 | Compatibility | | 15 | 15 | 25 |
| 5 | Implementation Process & Timeline | | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| 5 | Product Features and Functionality | | 4 | 5 | 4 |
| 5 | Customer Service & Technical Support | | 4 | 4 | 5 |
| 40 | | | | | |

EVALUATOR NAME(S)

Jennifer Douglas
Jennifer Walker

EVALUATION TYPE **Group**
Group/Individual

Jennifer Walker
AUTHORIZED SIGNATURE

Digitally signed by Jennifer Walker
Date: 2019.04.03 08:32:45 -05'00'

Library Services Manager
TITLE

4/2/2019
DATE

PRODUCT & SERVICES EVALUATION

## 1. COMPATIBILITY:

*Briefly explain why compatibility is important to the evaluation of this RFP.*

In FY 2018, 40% of e-book circulation (8580 of 21347 total check-outs) was in the Amazon Kindle proprietary formats used by Kindle e-readers.  We do not want to lose this portion of our digital circulation, therefore compatibility with Kindle e-readers is critically important to us.  The scores given reflect this importance.  Overdrive is currently the only company that is compatible with Kindle e-readers, and thus have received 100% of the score, while B&T and bibliotheca have been given 60% of the total score, which reflects the 60% of current circulation not in Kindle's proprietary formats.

## 2. IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS & TIMELINE:

*Briefly explain why Implementation Process & Timeline is important to the evaluation of this RFP.*

In order to prevent a service disruption, the implementation process and migration timeline is an important piece of this bid.  As our existing platform, Overdrive would need no migration time, so has received the highest score. Bibliotheca indicates 30-60 days in various places in their bid, and has received the next highest score.  B&T has the longest migration timeframe at an estimated 90 days, and has received the lowest score.

## 3. PRODUCT FEATURES AND FUNCTIONALITY:

*Briefly explain why Product Features and Functionality is important to the evaluation of this RFP.*

Outside of compatibility, which is addressed in section 1, the only real point of difference between vendors as applies to product features and functionality is indicated in question 16 of the products and services questionnaire- "Are customers required to register/sign on in vendor website in order to download ebooks?" Bibliotheca does not require sign in on a vendor site and has received the highest score; B&T and Overdrive indicate that they do require sign in and have been rated equally.

## 4. CUSTOMER SERVICE AND TECHNICAL SUPPORT:

*Briefly explain why Customer Service and Technical Support is important to the evaluation of this RFP.*

Customer service and technical support a vital components of any digital product.  As our current provider, Overdrive has given us excellent customer support and has been rated at the highest score.  B&T and bibliotecha are both established vendors in the library community with excellent reputations, and have been rated equally.

## PRODUCT & SERVICES EVALUATION

**BAKER & TAYLOR**                    *What influenced this score? What information was used?*

| COMPATIBILITY | In the product and services questionnaire question 4, B&T states that they are not compatible with Amazon's content repository. Ebooks for Kindle e-readers must be fulfilled from this repository. |
|---|---|
| IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS & TIMELINE | Per section 3a of their bid response, under "Content Transfer-Free of Charge" it is stated that the transfer of content can be completed in approximately 90 days. |
| PRODUCT FEATURES AND FUNCTIONALITY | All questions in the products and services questionnaire were considered for this score, with the exception of question 4, which was scored under "Compatibility".  Question 16 represents the only real variation in functionality amongst the vendors. B&T indicates that users do have to sign in to the vendor site to download eBooks. |
| IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS & TIMELINE | CUSTOMER SERVICE AND TECHNICAL SUPPORT - We do not have current experience with B&T's customer service and technical support, but they have an established and well-regarded reputation in the library community, and their narrative indicates an acceptable level of support. |

**BIBLIOTHECA**                    *What influenced this score? What information was used?*

| COMPATIBILITY | In the product and services questionnaire question 4, bibliotheca is not compatible with Kindle e-readers (Kindle Fire is a tablet not an e-reader.) |
|---|---|
| IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS & TIMELINE | On page 12 of their bid response, bibliotecha states that their normal implementation time is four to six weeks.  On page 17, under the heading "Easing the Transition" they state that migration to cloudLibrary takes a minimum of 6-8 weeks. |
| PRODUCT FEATURES AND FUNCTIONALITY | All questions in the products and services questionnaire were considered for this score, with the exception of question 4, which was scored under "Compatibility".  Question 16 represents the only real variation in functionality amongst the vendors. Bibliotheca indicates that users do NOT have to sign in to the vendor site to download eBooks. |
| IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS & TIMELINE | CUSTOMER SERVICE AND TECHNICAL SUPPORT - We do not have current experience with bibliotheca's customer service and technical support, but they have an established and well-regarded reputation in the library community, and their narrative indicates an acceptable level of support. |

**OVERDRIVE**                    *What influenced this score? What information was used?*

| COMPATIBILITY | In the product and services questionnaire question 4, Overdrive indicates compatibility with all generations of Amazon Kindle e-readers. |
|---|---|
| IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS & TIMELINE | As our current vendor, if selected Overdrive will continue service, with no migration or implementation necessary. |
| PRODUCT FEATURES AND FUNCTIONALITY | All questions in the products and services questionnaire were considered for this score, with the exception of question 4, which was scored under "Compatibility".  Question 16 represents the only real variation in functionality amongst the vendors. Overdrive indicates that users do have to sign in to the vendor site to download eBooks. |
| IMPLEMENTATION PROCESS & TIMELINE | CUSTOMER SERVICE AND TECHNICAL SUPPORT - We have received excellent customer service and tech support from Overdrive over the course of our current contract, and their narrative indicates that this level of service will not change if the new contract is awarded to them. |