

City of Grand Prairie - EAP Proposal Scorecard

9/21/2018

SCORING (1=worst; 5=best)		Cigna	Deer Oaks	Workers Assistance Program, DBA Alliance Work Partners
Plan Benefits and Services Offered (Scale 1-5) - 35pts		3	5	4
Network (contract terms) (Scale 1-5) - 15pts		5	4	3
References (Scale 1-5) - 10pts		4	5	5
Fees (Scale 1-5) - 40pts		3	5	4
TOTAL POINTS		3.4	4.85	3.95

EAP Proposal Fee Analysis

Headcount 1600	Magellan (current vendor)	Cigna	Deer Oaks (Recommended)	WAP/Alliance Work Partners
Cost PEPM (Per Employee Per Month)	\$1.52	\$1.58	\$1.37	\$1.44
Monthly Premiums	\$2,432.00	\$2,528.00	\$2,192.00	\$2,304.00
Annual Premiums	\$29,184.00	\$30,336.00	\$26,304.00	\$27,648.00
Included Services				
How many visits are included?	5 visits	5 visits	6 visits	5 visits
Annual Critical Incident Response Hours (included in PEPM cost)	Critical Incidents are unlimited, w cap of 25 hrs/event. After 25 hours, cost is \$250/hr	Critical incident services provided at no cost under the "16 employer service hours." Addtl hrs needed cost \$285/hr.	Unlimited critical incident response with a 2-hour onsite response per event.	Unlimited
Annual Training Hours (included in PEPM cost)	5 hrs annually for onsite training, webinars, or health fair	16 hr annually, but includes critical incident hours, onsite trainings, webinars, or promotional activities.	5 hrs annually for onsite training; Addtl 12 hours Webinar/online demand; two days health fair attendance	5 hrs annually for onsite/webinar; Orientation and health fair-free and unlimited.
Adoption Assistance	Included	Included	Included	Included
Online Training Sessions	Included	Included	Included	Included
Child Care Search Services	Included	Included	Included	Included
Legal Services (up to 3 consultations)	Included	Included	Included	Included
Financial Counseling	Included	Included	Included	Included
Smoking Cessation	Included	Not Included	Included	Included
Legal Services Discounts	Included	Included	Included	Included
Elder Care Services	Included	Included	Included	Included
Stress Management Services	Included	Included	Included	Included
Wellness Services	Included	Included	Included	Included
Onsite Training Sessions (Lunch and	Included	Included	Included	Included
Mandatory Referral Case	Included	Included	Included	Included
Annual Home Mailing	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included	Not Included
Guarantees/Renewals				
Rate Guarantee		3 year rate guarantee; 3% inc yr 4 & 5	5 year rate guarantee	3 year rate guarantee; 5% inc yr 4 & 5
2019	No Proposal Submitted	\$30,336	\$26,304	\$27,648
Rate Guarantee 2020	No Proposal Submitted	\$30,336	\$26,304	\$27,648
Rate Guarantee 2021	No Proposal Submitted	\$30,336	\$26,304	\$27,648
Rate Guarantee 2022	No Proposal Submitted	\$31,246	\$26,304	\$29,030
Rate Guarantee 2023	No Proposal Submitted	\$32,183	\$26,304	\$30,482
Total Estimated Cost Over 5 Years		\$154,438	\$131,520	\$142,456
Additional Services/Costs				
Critical Services	\$0.00	\$0.00	Unlimited	\$0.00
Additional Onsite Training (Hourly)	\$0.00	\$255.00	\$300.00	\$250.00
Critical Incident Response Fee (Hourly)	\$0.00	\$285.00	Unlimited	\$0.00
Travel Costs (Hourly)	\$0.00	Included	Included	Billed per expense (mileage, etc), not hourly